SOLAR NEUTRINOS: THE PIONEERING EXPERIMENTS

Till Kirsten, Max-Planck-Institut für Kernphysik, Heidelberg

- 1. Solar Model + Neutrino Fluxes
- 2. The Radiochemical Method
- 3. HOMESTAKE Chlorine Experiment
- 4. KAMIOKANDE (+SK) *real-time* Experiment
- 5. GALLEX (+GNO) Gallium Experiment
- 6. SAGE Gallium Experiment
- 7. SYNOPSIS (as of the end of the past millenium)

1. Solar Model + Neutrino Fluxes

A.S. Eddington



John Bahcall



Standard Solar Model



solar mass, radius, luminosity, age chemical composition (Z) nuclear cross sections (S-factors) opacities Observable random conditions through HELIO-SEISMOLOGIE see sect. 7

For the SUN, the pp-cycle dominates

4 H⁺ + 2e⁻ → ⁴He⁺⁺ + 2
$$\nu_e$$
 + 26.73 MeV
< E(2 ν_e) > = 0.59 MeV



SOLAR NEUTRINO SPECTRUM



2. The Radiochemical Method



Bruno Pontecorvo

The *radiochemical* detection technique approached the problem of the incredibly low interaction cross sections of low energy neutrinos by using very large target masses and by collecting the reaction products over extended time periods. After the conceptional impetus by Bruno Pontecorvo, It was first applied by Ray Davis for his Chlorine detector, in which, however, pp-neutrinos were not accessible because their energy is below the threshold of the Cl³⁷-Ar³⁷ reaction.



Radiochemical Method

- * Large Target Quantities (many tons)
- * Underground Lab to shield from Cosmic Radiation
- * Radiochemical Purity (Side Reactions)
- * Extraction of Product Nuclides (separation factor ≈10³⁰)
- * Individual Atom Detection ('free' of Background)

TYPICAL RATES:

Only of order 1^{v} -capture per day in 10 - 1000 tons, depending on the target element

Davis Homestake chlorine experiment, *first* detection of solar neutrinos (⁸B-neutrinos), 1970

Threshold 814 keV, hence not sensitive to main neutrino branches (pp, ⁷Beneutrinos)

GALLEX experiment at Gran Sasso.

Threshold 233 keV, main signal from ppand ⁷Be neutrinos

<u>3. HOMESTAKE Chlorine Experiment</u>



Raymond Davis jr.

Homestake Setup







Results of The Homestake Experiment



615 tons of liquid Perchlorethylene (C₂Cl₄) Homestake Mine; South Dakota USA; 4200mwe; 1964-1994

- First measurement of solar neutrino interaction rate
- Raised the problem of missing neutrinos ("SNP")

- Opened a new field of research. Davis was awarded the Nobel prize in 2002 "for pioneering contributions to astrophysics, in particular for the detection of cosmic neutrinos"

Rate = 2.56 \pm 0.23 SNU; SSM expectation was = 8 \pm 3 SNU (3 σ) (SNU = Solar Neutrino Unit = 10⁻³⁶ events/target atom/s) [Summary, Cleveland et al., Nucl.Phys.B (Proc.Suppl.) 38,47,1995] Constancy of the solar neutrino flux (over 23 years): no correlation has been found between the production rate and the solar cycle, inspite of many speculation on this item in the '90th.

4. Kamiokande Experiment

KAMIOKANDE 1983-1996

this real-time water Cerenkov detector aimed primarily for proton decay and atmospheric neutrinos.

Initially, Solar neutrinos (and the surprising Supernova 1987a) have been more or less subordinated step-childs because of their lower Energy



Kamiokande

1982: KamiokaNDE was funded

Nucleon decay experiment

operation:1983-1996



- Total mass: 3000 tons
 [15.6mφ x 16m in height]
- Inner mass: 2140 tons [fid. 680 tons for solar v]
- 948 20-in PMTs (cov. 20%)

K + SK Phases

Experi- ment- phase	PMT- cover- age	Time period	days	Fid. mass [tons]	E _e - thresh. [MeV]	observed V∘ events	⁸ B-v Flux [10 ⁶ /cm ² /s]
KAMIO-		1/1987 – 2/1995	2079	680	7.5	830	2.82 ± 0.38
KANDE					τ		
SUPER-	40%	5/1996 - 7/2001	1496	22500	5.0	22400 + 230	2.35 ± 0.08
KAM-I				2			2.55 ± 0.00
Accident		Nov. 2001					
SUPER-	19%	12/2002 - 10/2005	791	22500	7.0	7213 + 152	2.38 ± 0.17
KAM-II							
SUPER-	40%	just started			5.0 or		
KAM-III					less		

⁸B-v flux is only *about half* of what is predicted from the Standard Solar Model (SSM)

From Y.Suzuki, adapted by T.K. for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris ¹³

Super-Kamiokande



5. GALLEX (+GNO)

Why sub-MeV Neutrinos?

98 % of all solar neutrinos are sub-MeV ($\Phi_7 \sim 7$ %, $\Phi_{pp} \sim 91$ %). The pp- neutrino flux is coupled to the solar luminosity. It is a fundamental astrophysical parameter that should definitely be measured, as precisely as possible. Stringent limitations (or observation) of departures from the standard solar model are obtained if the flux of pp neutrinos could be deduced.

Pre - Gran Sasso Time



Brookhaven, March 1979

Preparing for the Experiment at Gran Sasso (1979) 1983 - 1985

- **1979** Underground laboratory proposed by Antonio Zichichi, President of INFN
- **1982** Start of excavations at Gran Sasso
- **1984** First meeting of TK with Nicola Cabibbo, INFN- President
- 1984 N. Cabibbo strongly supports solar neutrino research as a major topic at LNGS

Formation of the GALLEX Collaboration

- 3 / 1984 KFK Karlsruhe joins MPIK
- 9 / 1984 TUM München joins
- **10 / 1984** Meeting at CdF in Paris: Frejus?
- 11 / 1984 N. Cabibbo favourable for space at LNGS. INFN Roma and Milano join
- **11 / 1984** Saclay joins for Gran Sasso
- 11 / 1984 WI Rehovot joins
 - 2 / 1985 Constituting GALLEX meeting

7 / 1985 Approval of GALLEX at LNGS by the GS Scientific Committee

At Hall A excavation site, 1987



GALLEX / GNO

Radiochemical Method (product accumulation) $v_e + Ga^{71} \rightarrow Ge^{71} + e^{-1}$ $\tau_{1/2}^{\uparrow} = 11.4 \text{ d}$

Low threshold! (0.233 MeV) Implies a serious challenge concerning backgrounds





GALLEX@LNGS (GRAN SASSO)





Tanks installed, September 1989



Germanium-Extraction System

Low Level Gas Proportional Counter

 Miniaturized Counters made from Suprasil ultrapure synthetical quartz
 Fe oder Si- Cathodes
 Counting gas: GeH4 + Xe
 Active Volume 0.6 – 0.9 cm³ only



Granada, June 8th, 1992 GALLEX announces first observation of solar pp-neutrinos at "Neutrino 92"



GALLEX RESULT IMPLICATIONS (1992)

 Physics Letters B285 (1992) 376
 Citation index 31.5.92: # 5 + # 11

 Physics Letters B285 (1992) 390
 14 RUNS

≈ 105 % of the pp- expectation
 ⇒ Hydrogen fusion in the solar interior experimentally observed

 ≈ 60 % of the total SSM- expectation
 ⇒ Definite deficit of pp- and/or ⁷Beneutrinos observed

NEUTRINO 92, Granada 7-12 June 1992

THE YO PP Summary Talk de Rujula **FUSION BOMB Conference** Summary Talk

[DETONATED OVER GRANADA BY TENTEN AT 6:15 p.m., JUNE 8^{fl} 1992]

Published data 1990-1998



Significance of Deficit in Time





Cr-source experiment

1: 1995 (PLB342) [1994] 2: 1998 (PLB420) [1996] 1+2 PS: 2010 (PLB685)

 $\begin{aligned} A(Cr1) &= 1.714 \pm 0.036 \text{ MCI} \\ A(Cr2) &= 1.868 \pm 0.073 \text{ MCI} \\ R(Cr1) &= 0.953 \pm 0.11 \\ R(Cr2) &= 0.812 \pm 0.10 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R_{\phi ps} &= 0.93 \pm 0.08 \end{aligned}$

Arsenic Tests

Repeated tests under variable and purposely unfavorable conditions respective to the:

- standing time
- mixing- and extraction conditions
- method and magnitude of carrier addition to exclude witholdings (classical or 'hot-atom'-effects) <u>Method:</u> Triple-batch comparison,
 272d
 - ≈ 30 000 ⁷¹As atoms (half-life 2.72 d) added to:
 - Tank sample, full GX procedure! External sample
 - Calibration sample (γ-spectrom.) Decay into ⁷¹Ge
 - Result: Recovery 99+ %



GALLEX final Results 1991-1997 Phys. Letters B 685 (2010) 47-54

GALLEX (65 runs) $73.4 \pm 7.1_{7.3}$ SNU

yet, not the end! \rightarrow GNO =

GALLIUM NEUTRINO OBSERVATORY

START of GNO

After a **complete overhaul** and modernization of the GALLEX detector in 1997/98, the reshaped collaboration resumed pp-neutrino recording in 1998 (after the ⁷¹As/⁷¹Ge activity from the As-Test was completely gone).



Gallium Result Summary 123 runs

GALLEX + GNO 69.3 ± 5.5 (incl. syst.) 1 May 1991 – April 2003

Compare with Solar Model prediction: 128 ± 9 SNU






LUCIANO MAIANI NICOLA CABIBBO ENRICO BELLOTTI

6. SAGE

(Soviet American Gallium Experiment) **Baksan Neutrino Observatory, Northern Caucasus,** 3.5 km from entrance of horizontal adit. 2100 m depth (4700 m.w.e.) Data taking: Jan 1990 - till present (2018), ≈50 tons of *metallic* Ga (in multiple reactors). ⁷¹Ge atoms are chemically extracted and their decay is counted. Sensitivity: One ⁷¹Ge atom from 5.10²⁹ atoms Ga with efficiency ~90%

From V.Gavrin, adapted by T.K. for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris



From V.N.Gavrin adapted by T.K. for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris

Measurement of the solar neutrino capture rate with gallium metal. ⁷¹Ga(v, e⁻)⁷¹Ge, E_{th} = 0.233 keV 17 year period (1990 – 2006): 157 runs



SAGE

SAGE continues regular solar neutrino extractions every four weeks with ~50 t of Ga

From V.N.Gavrin, adapted by T.K. for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris 40

V.N.Gavrin, 5th Intern. Solar Neutrino Conf., Dresden June 11-14 2018

1990 – Oct. 2017: 266 runs 64.5 $^{+2.4}_{-2.3}$ (stat) $^{+2.6}_{-2.8}$ (syst) SNU



Combined results for each year



Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino September 5,2018 Paris (from .N.Gavrin) 42



Can the astrophysical solution be a viable explanation of the observed v-flux deficits?

Helioseismology confirms the Standard Solar Model with a high degree of accuracy

For the same input data, ν-flux predictions of different authors are consistent

the impact of fine tuning for:

He-diffusion; Z-diffusion, rotational mixing, opacity codes (Z/X, partial ionization, screeningmodifications,...) is generally of order $\leq 10\%$ (especially also for ⁷Be- ν)

just to lower the central temperature is not sufficient to explain the data

NO Particle physics solution is required!

Situation of Solar $\nu\,$ when Super-K started:

4 solar v experiments and 4 solutions



from Y.Suzuki, adapted by T.K for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris ⁴⁵

Below ~1-2 MeV, the vacuum oscillation domain takes over from the matter oscillation domain at > 2 MeV



Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris 46

CONSEQUENCES



Neutrino-Masses

Solar Neutrinos $v_{e} \leftrightarrow v_{\mu}$ (Gallex, SuperKamiokande, SNO) Atmospheric Neutrinos (SuperKamiokande) $v_{\mu} \leftrightarrow v_{\tau}$

- The positively detected ppneutrinos confirm the fundamentals of stellar structure
- Neutrino-oscillations are responsible for the reduced flux also for the more energetic neutrinos (⁷Be-, ⁸B-ν)
- Neutrino masses are ≠ 0, yet too small to account for the cosmologically ,,missing mass"



Radiochemical experiments led to great pathmaking discoveries, till the turn of the last millenium. This phase ceased with the advent of real-time experiments (SK,SNO,Borexino,Kamland...) that now allowed to observe multiple parameters synchroneously, not just reaction rates only. merci!

SPARES

1. Solar Model + Neutrino Fluxes



REAL TIME LOOK INTO THE INTERIOR TEST OF STELLAR STRUCTURE AND EVOLUTION $N_v(E)dE = f(T(r); (\rho); composit.)$

v NEUTRINO:

IN VACUO: 150 Mio km (8 min)

IN MATTER:: 700 000 km

Test of NEUTRINO PROPERTIES (especially : rest mass)

ve- DISAPPEARANCE through: flavor changes !?

decay ??

Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris

50

BASIC SOLAR MODEL

(Eddington, Bethe, Vogt, Bahcall, Turck-Chieze, ...)

Mass and chemical composition determine unequivocally the structure and evolution of main sequence stars (Vogt's law)

	Н	Не	,metals'
initial	71 %	27 %	2 %
now	34 %	64 %	2 %
AGE of the SUN		4.6 x 10 ⁹ vrs	

CENTRAL TEMPERATURE CENTRAL DENSITY CENTRAL PRESSURE LUMINOSITY 15.6 x 10⁶ °C 148 g/cm³ 2.3 x 10¹¹ Bar 3.9 x 10²³ kW

The solar core, the strongest accessible low energy neutrino source

 $N_{v}(E)dE = f[T(r); \rho(r), composition]$

Test of stellar structure and evolution

Real time look into the stellar interior!



Neutrino Flavour Oscillations



Oscillation length $L \propto E/\Delta m^2$

for the distance Sun-Earth, this is sensitive to
masses as small as Δm² ≈ 10⁻¹¹ (eV/c²)²Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris53

pp - Neutrinos as Standard Candle to deduce Neutrino Oscillations and Neutrino Mass

Neutrino propagation

- in vacuo: 150 Mio km (8 min)
- *in matter:* 700 000 km

v_e - disappearance due to flavour changes (neutrino oscillations) ? To claim this,

 the flux at origin (the solar core) must be well known

Inverse ß Process

B.Pontecorvo 1946 (Chalk River Report PD-205)

"the experimental observation of an inverse beta process produced by neutrinos is not out of the question with the modern experimental facilities" 'The radioactivity of the produced nucleus (in: $v_e + Z \rightarrow (Z+1) + \beta^-$) may be looked for as proof of the inverse process" "The essential point, in this method, is that radioactive atoms produced by an inverse ß-ray process have different chemical properties from the irradiated atoms. Consequently, it may be possible to concentrate the radioactive atoms of known period from a very large irradiated volume"

B. Pontecorvo 1946 on pre-requisites:

The nucleus produced in inverse ßtransformations must be radioactive with a *period* of at least one day, because of the long time involved in the separation. The separation of the radioactive atoms from the irradiated material must be relatively simple. The **background** (i.e., the production of element Z+1 by other causes than the inverse ß process) must be as small as possible. The material to be irradiated must not be too expensive.

Related road-making of Pontecorvos universal ideas and anticipations

Inverse ß-decay Chalk River Report PD-205, 1946

Leptonic charge JINR P-95, Dubna 1957 v - Oscillations (also $v \Leftrightarrow v$) Usp.Fiz.Nauk 79,3-21,1963

Double Beta Decay (also ¹³⁰Te/¹²⁸Te) Phys.Lett. 26B, 630, 1968

- Proportional Counting Helv.Phys.Acta 23, Suppl.3, 97-118, 1950
- (also pulse shape analysis) 1968

Conceptional Conditions for Radiochemical Solar Neutrino Experiments

Inverse ß-decay - sensitive only to v_e - not to $v_{\mu,\tau}$

Extremely small production rates \rightarrow huge target size (multi tons) Side reactions (Cosmic radiation, radioactivity) \rightarrow underground laboratories, passive and active shielding, ultrapurity of target and auxiliary components Extreme separation factors, $O(1:10^{30}) \rightarrow$ purging techniques Very low background detection of single radioactive atoms proportional counting with pulse shape analysis

<u>3. Homestake Chlorine Experiment</u>

Strictly following Pontecorvos receipt

"The experiment with Chlorine, for example, would consist in irradiating with neutrinos a large volume of Chlorine or Carbon Tetra Chloride, for a time of the order of one month, and extracting the radioactive Ar³⁷ from such volume by boiling. The radioactive argon would be introduced inside a small counter, the counting efficiency is close to 100%, because of the high Auger electron yield".

Early milestones towards Homestake

- 1949 L.W.Alvarez describes CI-detector details and backgrounds (for use near a nuclear reactor!) (UCRL-328
- 1953 **Davis** detects 37 Ar in perchlorethylen (C₂Cl₄)
- What is the expected rate from ⁸B?(Detector size?)
- 1959 Holmgreen+Johnston: σ(³He,⁴He)⁷Be+γ is large
- 1963 Mottelson ⁸B-v+³⁷Cl→³⁷Ar+e⁻ super-allowed analogue state of ³⁷Cl at 5.1 MeV contributes a lot
- 1968 J.Bahcall updates rate to 7.5 ± SNU
- Davis measures ≈ 1/3
- 1969 Gribov+ Pontecorvo (PLB28,493): $v_e^-v_\mu$ oscillation (T still unknown) $\rightarrow 1/2$

The Pioneering Davis Chlorine Experiment

WITH REACTOR ANTINEUTRINOS Savannah River, 4 tons, 1958

³⁷Cl (?, e⁻)³⁷Ar (E_{thr} = 813 keV)

$$K_{shell} EC$$
 $\tau = 50.5 d$
 $3^7Cl + 2.82 \text{ keV} (Auger e^-, X)$

no signal above muonic background!

WITH SOLAR NEUTRINOS Homestake mine

³⁷Cl (
$$v_e, e^-$$
)³⁷Ar ($E_{thr} = 813 \text{ keV}$)
 $K_{shell} EC$ ($\tau = 50.5 \text{ d}$
 $3^7Cl + 2.82 \text{ keV}$ (Auger e^-, X)

signal ! (even though less than expected, $\sim 1/3$)

1983: KM started

- Immediately after the start, KM
- observed μ decay electrons down to 15 MeV
- Realized a possibility to lower the threshold down to 10 MeV
- Solar neutrino measurement becomes possible
 - Background must be reduced
 - Spallation, external-γ, Rn
 - Most problem in low energy is Rn:

²¹⁴Bi
$$\rightarrow$$
 ²¹⁴Po + e⁻ + \bar{v} (E_{max}^{e} = 3.26 MeV)



Kamiokande-II



- For the upgrade of Kamiokande detector, Penn Group (Al Mann and his colleagues) joined KM w/timing electronics. KM-II formed
- 1987.1: KM-II started w/ outer layer, new timing elec.
- 1987.2: detection of SN1987A

from Y.Suzuki, adapted by T.K. for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris 63

Two Early Hints from KM-II

- 1988: atmospheric neutrino anomaly
 - Kamiokande Observed fewer µlike events in atmospheric v interactions than expected
 - Phys. Lett. B205, 416(1988).
- 1989: solar neutrino detection
 - KM-II: a second solar neutrino experiment, confirmed the solar neutrino deficits of the Davis's experiment
 - 21years after his first indication
 - Real time measurement w/ energy and direction measurement
 - Phys. Rev. Lett. 63, 16(1989).



Super-Kamiokande



- 50,000 tons (22,500 ton fid.) Ring Imaging Water Cherenkov Detector
- 1,000m underground
- Inner-Detector (ID)
 - -11,146 50cmφ PMTs (40%)Outer-Detector (OD)
 - -1,885 20cm PMTs

 ~ 130 collaborators from 36 institutions (10 countries) as of 2017 Japan, US, Poland, Spain, China, Korea, Canada, UK, France, Italy



Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris

66

ACTIVE DATA TAKING

- Start of Solar Neutrino Recordings 14.5.1991
- First Data Release (GALLEX I): 8.6.1992
- **GALLEX II Recordings: 8/1992 6/1994**
- Ist ⁵¹Cr Source Experiment 6/1994 10/1994
- GALLEX III Recordings: 10/1994 9/1995
 CLAIM FOR MASSIVE NEUTRINOS
- 2nd ⁵¹Cr Source Experiment 10/1995 2/1996
- GALLEX IV Recordings: 2/1996 23.1.1997
- ➢ ⁷¹As-Test of the Detector: 2/1997 4/1997
- **GNO Data Taking: 5/1998 9.4.2003**



3 / 1996 GNO Proposal submitted to INFN

Motivations

- continuous monitoring of the Sun after completion of GALLEX in 1997
- maintain possibility for a 100 ton experiment (Ga from GNO and SAGE combined) for statistical error reduction
- option of additional neutrino source calibrations for systematical error reduction

- 20.12.1996

INFN - approval by providing the \$\$\$ required to keep the Ga beyond 1997



Dip. Di Fisica dell'Università di Milano
 "La Bicocca" e INFN sez. Milano



- INFN Laboratori Nazionali del Gran
 Sasso
- Dip. Di Fisica dell'Università di Roma
 "Tor Vergata" e INFN sez. Roma II
- Dip. Di Ingegneria Chimica e dei Materiali Università dell'Aquila



Max Planck Institut fur Kernphysik Heidelberg



Physik Dep. E15 - Technische
 Universitaet - Muenchen

Latest Update

F.Kaether, W.Hampel, G.Heusser, J.Kiko, T.Kirsten, PLB 685(2010) 47-50

Results of a recent complete *P* **re-analysis of the Gallex+GNO data**

- (using ~10⁵ Ge-decays per counter) not allowed before completion of the low rate measurment phase (solar runs)
- Improved Rn-cut efficiency (multi-year low-rate
- Counter efficiency error reduction after full calibration experiment)
- full PSA instead of RTA

Also for Cr-source data

- -Counter efficiency error reduction after full calibration (as above)
- solar subtraction to include also GNO data


The End

(Gallium was sold in April 2007 to Recapture Metals Inc., Ontario, Canada)

April 6, 2005 : GNO17, the last regular (semi-annual) GNO meeting was held in Assergi

Febr 28, 2006: *Final Celebration Ceremony* for GALLEX/GNO at Gran Sasso, ending a successful fifteen year period that

started

with the Inauguration Ceremony on November 30, 1990

Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris

CREDITS

- INFN Nicola Cabibbo, Luciano Maiani,...
- LNGS still unique facility worldwide Enrico Bellotti,...
- MPG
- KRUPP Foundation
- CNRS
- Smoothly functioning international collaboration with wonderful colleagues

Reference for more internal details:

 Radiochemical Solar Neutrino Experiments: Door opener for modern Astroparticle Physics Il Nuovo Saggiatore, Percorsi, Vol.31/ No1-2/ p.46-58/ anno2015

Published data 1990-1998



Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris

75

SAGE January 1990 – December 2003 14 years – 121 runs 66.9 ^{+5.3}-5.0 SNU



From V.N.Gavrin, adapted by T.K. for: History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris 76

SAGE & GALLEX neutrino source experiments *Neutrino sources:*

⁵¹Cr: 747 keV (81.6%), 427 keV (9.0%), 752 keV (8.5%), 432 keV (0.9%)
³⁷Ar: 811 keV (90.2%), 813 keV (9.8%)

GALLEX (6/1994+9/1995) A(Cr1) = 1.714 ± 0.036 MCI A(Cr2) = 1.868 ± 0.073 MCI SAGE (1996+2004) A(Cr) = 0.517 ± 0.006 MCI A(Ar) = 0.409 ± 0.002 MCI

Results vs. Expectation (based on Bahcall 1997)

 $R(Cr_1) = 0.953 \pm 0.11$ $R(Cr_2) = 0.812 \pm 0.10$ $R(Cr_s) = 0.95 + 0.12$ $R(Ar) = 0.791 \pm 0.084$

Till Kirsten, MPIK Heidelberg, History of the Neutrino, September 5, 2018 Paris (Sage data from V.N.Gavrin, as quoted on top)

Mass mixing plot for Gallex/GNO



Oscillation parameters

If the LMA(MSW) solution is the correct explanation of the SNO/SK data, then vacuum oscillations must dominate below 1 MeV and the mixing angle is estimated as $\theta = 32 \pm 1.6$ degrees (B-PG04)

From our data we extract the suppression factor P for sub-MeV pp- and ⁷Be neutrinos (after a small correction for the minor ⁸B contribution from the known ⁸B-flux data of SNO/SK) as

 $P = 1 - 0.5 \sin^2(2\theta) = 0.556 \pm 0.071$

Hence,

 θ = 35.2 ^{+9.8}_{-5.4} degrees

THIS AGREEMENT IMPLIES THE EXPERIMENTAL VERIFICATION OF THE SOLAR MODEL AND OF THE NEUTRINO OSCILLATION MECHANISMNS at ENERGIES THAT ARE OTHERWISE INACCESSIBLE